OTM-R Checklist for organisations

Case number: 2021IT599603
Name Organisation under review: University of Palermo
Organisation's contact details: piazza marina 61, Palermo, 90133
Submission date to the European Commission: 13/07/2022
Organisation's contact details: Clelia Dispenza, *Delegate of the Rector for the implementation of the "Human Resources Strategy for Researchers Incorporating the Charter & Code"*

INTERNAL REVIEW including the REVISED **HRS4R ACTION PLAN** SUBMISSION DATE: 13 July 2022

OTM-R	Open	Trans-parent	Merit-based	Answers: ++ Yes, completely +/-Yes, substantially -/+ Yes, partially -- No	[Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)] Comments
1. Have we published a version of our OTM-R policy online (in the national language and in English)?		x	x	-/+	*[Publication of the OTM-R policy in the UniPa Website, date of the latest version, date of the communication/presentation to all staff]* Recruitment policies and working conditions for academic staff are defined by the Italian legislation (L.240/2010) and recent modifications (L. 29 June 2022). **Recruitment procedures and practices are defined by UniPa internal written regulations to comply with the obligations established by the relevant National Legislation for Academic Recruitment and for Transparent Procedures in Public Administration (D.Lgs 97/216).** Unipa statutory provisions regulating recruitment are published online, only in Italian language, in the Unipa web-site (latest update on 09/06/2022). (https://www.unipa.it/amministrazione/arearisorseumane/settorereclutamentoesele

					zioni/.content/2022/2663_regolamento_docenti.pdf)
					An OTM-R internal guide will be elaborated by the Working Group for the European Charter for Researchers and the Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers (hereinafter "Charter & Code" Working Group or C&C WG), chaired by the Delegate of the Rector for the Implementation of the "Human Resources Strategy for Researchers Incorporating the Charter & Code" (see **Action 6 of the Revised HRS4R Action Plan**).
					The guide will clarify what an OTM-R System is, how the entire academic staff can contribute to its OTM-R system and will collect, in a single document, all relevant procedures and practices for the recruitment for all type of positions, in Italian and in English.
2. Do we have an internal guide setting out clear OTM-R procedures and practices for all types of positions?	x	x	x	+/-	*[Section of the OTM-R internal guide. Date of latest version; date of the communication to all staff and publication in the website]* For the recruitment of professors of the first and second rank and for the recruitment of researchers on temporary contracts, UniPa has elaborated and constantly updated guidelines for the formation of the selection committees (latest version of the 13/6/2022:https://www.unipa.it/amministrazione/arearisorseumane/settorereclutament oeselezioni/.content/2022/2684-linee_guida-prot.pdf). The competent administrative offices ("SETTORE RECLUTAMENTO E SELEZIONI" for R2, R3 and R4 and "DOTTORATO" for R1) provide the selection committees with clear instructions, relevant legislation, forms and document explaining the procedural steps, etc., as well as with continuous advice throughout the entire procedure. Internal regulations and guidelines must ensure that recruitment and career advancement procedures for researchers are open, transparent and merit-based.
3. Is everyone involved in the process sufficiently trained in the area	x	x	x	+/-	*[Existence of training programmes for OTM-R (for selection commitee members]*

of OTM-R?					The administrative/technical staff in the area of OTM-R are regularly updated on legal, technical and IT matters. **Action 20 of the Revised HRS4R Action Plan** aims to map staff qualification and address training needs in the area of OTM-R. Heads of Department and selection committee members receive written guidelines and instructions, but they do not receive specific training in the area of OTM-R. This training will be provided as part of the Leadership Development programme (see **Action 18 of the Revised HRS4R Action Plan**).
4. Do we make (sufficient) use of e-recruitment tools?	x	x		++	[*Web-based tool for (all) the stages in recruitment process*] Applications for all types of positions can only be made electronically. EU applicants may self-certify their qualifications and scanned copies of all documents are accepted. If there is no electronic signature on the application, the application is nevertheless accepted and a hard copy with original signature is requested at the end of the procedure. Non-EU researchers cannot provide self-certifications of some qualifications due to restrictions under Italian law. As part of its initiatives to digitize its procedures, Unipa has recently adopted the new e-recruitment platform "PICA" (Piattaforma Integrata Concorsi Atenei) for the recruitment of researchers and professors/advanced lecturers. The interview of foreign PhD candidates can be handled remotely, by video-conference, using Microsoft Teams or Skype.
5. Do we have a quality control system for OTM-R in place?	x	x		+/-	[*Existence of Quality control system*] National Ministry regulations and internal regulations (in line with the ministerial provisions) are strictly applied. Internal administrative offices check that all criteria are satisfied, and the Rector approves the whole procedure.

					Surveys for assessing the satisfaction of the applicants with the procedure and identify areas of improvement will be elaborated by the C&C WG.
6. Does our current OTM-R policy encourage external candidates to apply?	x	x	x	-/+	*[Relative % of applicants from outside the institution]* According to the National legislation, calls for all type of positions are open to external candidates. In accordance with the relevant national legislation, the internal regulations of UniPa, until a recent past, have provided for a limited number of procedures to be reserved to internal candidates. Such procedures always required a transparent and merit-based selection procedure. The Senate and the Board of Directors allocate a percentage of the funds for the recruitment of external candidates in the role of researchers and professors (20%). For the recruitment of PhD students, the number of PhD students with degree from other Universities is encouraged by the Ministry of Education and Research, being an award criterion for the ordinary financing funds. All UniPa PhD programmes reserve one or more positions to students with a foreign degree. In order to improve its OTM-R System, UniPa has undertaken to issue the OTM-R internal guide (in Italian and English) aimed at clarifying for each step of the academic career including requirements to be met with in order to apply for a position; sources where competition notices are published; knowledge and skills required for a specific position; sources providing the relevant rules on the specific selection procedure, procedures to follow to have access to the selection committees minutes (when they are not available), to express complaints or to challenge the result of the selection **(Action 6 of the Revised HRS4R Action Plan).**
7. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract researchers from abroad?	x	x	x	+/-	*[Relative % of applicants from foreign citizens]* Our policies are in line with the National policies. Application for all type of positions is open to all foreign citizens who meet the requirements established by the competition notices. Competition notices are always translated in English and published in EURAXESS and in the UniPa website.

					Yet, the National Scientific Habilitation (ASN) - that is a mandatory step to access to Italian Universities in the role of Professors - has an English website that is not updated since 2013. This may discourage foreign applicants. Salaries and pay scales are set by national legislation, which does not help Italian universities to compete for the most talented applicants worldwide. All relevant statutory provisions and internal regulations and forms are published in the University website, only in Italian. An abstract of the statutory provisions and internal regulations for the recruitment and carrier progression at UniPa, in English, will be provided as part of the OTM-R internal guide **(Action 6 of the Revised HRS4R Action Plan)**. The C&C Working Group will develop a more general and informative research career guide, aimed mainly at PhD students and early-stage researchers **(Action 7 of the Revised HRS4R Action Plan).**
8. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract under-represented groups?	x	x	x	+/-	The Ethical Code of UniPa (published in the University website only in Italian) expressly establishes equal dignity of all members of the academic community and provides that all its members, both in their individual roles and in collegial committees, shall respect and promote equality and human dignity, reject all forms of unfair discrimination and recognize the value of individual and cultural diversity. In accordance with the relevant national legislation. No calls can be reserved for under-represented groups, because they might constitute a potential form of discrimination. The recruitment regulations and guidelines, as well as the procedures for verifying the documents supporting the recruitment process, must make it possible to identify potential cases of discrimination that violate the Unipa Statute and Code of Ethics. Support can be provided for people with disabilities. The relevant national legislation provides tax benefits for researchers returning from abroad and measures to protect researchers on maternity leave (both during

					employment and during the evaluation phase) and researchers who — due to health problems — cannot guarantee a constant level of scientific productivity.
9. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to provide attractive working conditions for researchers?	x	x	x	-/+	*[Relative % of applicants from outside the institution]* PhD candidates, temporary and permanent faculty members have access to laboratories, library and e-resources. Head of Departments are encouraged to provide each newly recruited researcher a personal working desk, equipped with laptop and/or PC. Unipa offers benefits for the access to the University sport campus to all the workers and their own families; a medical assistance points for all students (including PhD students); a nursery open to PhD students, professors, researchers, administrative staff; discounts on the fares for public transportation, car and bike sharing, and for theater and concert tickets (CRAL). There are no specific economic incentives, such as start-up packages, to encourage the application of external candidates for researcher and professor positions.
10. Do we have means to monitor whether the most suitable researchers apply?	x	x	x	-/+	*[Number of applicants per position, relative % of the applicants that fulfill the criteria for the position]* The internal regulations of UniPa expressly require that the selected candidate should be the most qualified to perform the functions for which the open position was advertised. They also establish that the evaluation criteria set forth in the competition notice, which should be the basis of the evaluation, should comply with national and international standards, as well as with any additional scientific and lecturing qualifications that may be considered essential. UniPa widely advertise open calls, through posts in "Gazzetta Ufficiale" the Official Journal of the Italian Republic, institutional web-sites of UniPa and MUR, and in Euraxess web-site. As part of the continued **Action 9 of the Revised HRS4R Action Plan the C&C WG** will encourage the Coordinators of the PhD programmes to advertise programmes and open

					calls on social media (Facebook, Instagram, Twitter, etc.) and professional web networks (Research Gate/Linkedin). On the other hand, UniPa does not performed surveys to identify target applicants and does not adopt active forms of recruitment (e.g. sending invitations to potential applicants).
Advertising and application phase					
11. Do we have clear guidelines or templates (e.g., EURAXESS) for advertising positions?	x	x		++	*[Existence of templates]* Calls for the open positions are advertised as prescribed by the National Legislation by the competent administrative offices. Competition notices are published in Unipa, Ministry of University (MUR), Euraxess websites and in the Italian Official Journal (Gazzetta Ufficiale), in Italian and in English.
12. Do we include in the job advertisement references/links to all the elements foreseen in the relevant section of the toolkit?	X	x		+/-	*[Existence of a guide for]* The information reported in the call allow the potential candidates to acquire all the relevant information. Information on professional development opportunities and career development prospects are not included in the call because the National Legislation requires a public competition for each step of carrier progression. In order to improve the transparency of the procedures for the recruitment and career progression of early stage researchers and to make open positions more attractive, UniPa has undertaken to issue a research career guide (in Italian and English) aimed at clarifying for each step of the academic career to PhD students and early stage researchers **(Action 7 of the Revised HRS4R Action Plan).**
13. Do we make full use of EURAXESS to ensure our research vacancies reach a wider audience?	x	x		++	*[Survey / results of Interviews]* 100 % of the vacancies are advertised in EURAXESS
14. Do we make use of other job	x	x		++	*[Survey / results of Interviews]*

advertising tools?					The calls for application are publicized in "Gazzetta Ufficiale" the Italian Official Journal, in the institutional web sites of UniPa and Ministry of University and Research. The effective use of these tools will
15. Do we keep the administrative burden to a minimum for the candidate? [see Chapter 4.4.1 b)]	x	x		+/-	*[Survey / results of Interviews]* For EU applicants, yes. The procedure can be handled electronically, and only self-certifications are required during the recruitment phase. Evidence can be requested at any time for the successful candidate's application. For the non-EU, applicants, recognition of qualifications for the purpose of enrolment is necessary, according to the National regulations.
Selection and evaluation phase					
16. Do we have clear rules governing the appointment of selection committees? [see Chapter 4.4.2 a)]		x	x	++	*[Internal written guidelines for the composition and appointment of selection committees, date of the last version]* Rules are mainly defined by the National legislation and further detailed in the internal written regulations (https://www.unipa.it/amministrazione/arearisorseumane/settorereclutamentoeselezioni/.content/2022/2684-linee_guida-prot.pdf). Committees are appointed with an administrative order after the call is closed, generally by drawing the members from a shortlist of suitable candidates provided by the Departments that have requested to open the position.
17. Do we have clear rules concerning the composition of selection committees?		x	x	++	*[Internal written guidelines for the composition and appointment of selection committees, date of the last version]* The National Legislation regulates the number of committee members (3), encourage

					to attain gender balance in the composition of the committee, requires the inclusion of (international) experts from other academies (2 out of 3), identify the criteria to assess qualification, competence and experience of committee members. The competent offices shall verify that each member of the selection Committees meets all the requirements.
18. Are the committees sufficiently gender-balanced		x	x	--	*[Relative % of men and women in the committee composition]* The internal regulations stipulate that the composition of selection committees shall ensure gender balance wherever possible.
19. Do we have clear guidelines for selection committees which help to judge 'merit' in a way that leads to the best candidate to be selected?		x	x	++	*[Existence of written guidelines and indicators published in each selection procedure]* The criteria defined in UniPa's internal regulations, in accordance with national legislation, provide a description of the knowledge and skills, additional scientific and teaching qualifications that may be considered essential for the position, which must form the basis for the assessment by the selection committees.
Appointment phase					
20. Do we inform all applicants at the end of the selection process	x	x			++	*[Web-info]* In compliance with the principles enshrined in the European Charter for Researchers and the Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers, as well as with the relevant national legislation, the internal regulations concerning the recruitment and career progression procedures of researchers provide that the acts of the Selection Committee, i.e. the minutes of the meetings, the annexes and the final report, are approved by Rectoral Decree, as a rule, within thirty days of their delivery to the competent administrative offices by the selection committee and are made public. The publication of the Rector's Decree approving the proceedings of the selection Committee and the final report counts as notification to all intents and purposes.
21. Do we provide adequate feedback to interviewees?		x		++	*[Web-info and emails]* The minutes of the meetings of the selection Committees include information about qualifications and publications (where required) that have been assessed, evaluation

					criteria adopted, grades and/or evaluation comments received by each single candidate and the outcome of the selection procedure. In the event that the final report discloses only the outcome of the selection procedure, but not the grades and/or evaluation comments received by each single candidate (where required), candidates may ask the competent offices to view their own grade and/or evaluation comment, as well as exercise their right of access to the files and view all the documentation relating to the ehole procedure, including the grades and/or evaluation comments received by the other candidates.
22. Do we have an appropriate complaints mechanism in place?		x		Yes, partially	*[Section of the OTM-R internal guide and link in the UniPa webpage where calls are advertised]* In accordance with the relevant national legislation, candidates may appeal against the rectoral decree approving the procedure. The deadlines for any complaints and appeals run from the date of publication of the rectoral decree. Guidelines for lodging complaints other than contesting the outcome of the selection procedure will be elaborated within the internal OTM-R guide.
Overall assessment					
23. Do we have a system in place to assess whether OTM-R delivers on its objectives?		x		+/-	*[OTM-R checklist update]* Currently, the C&C Working Group will use a periodic review of this checklist to assess whether the OTM-R achieves its objectives. Other forms of evaluation will be developed and considered